

Biden v. Byrne

C/A No. 2:23-cv-09430-SVW-PD

Plaintiff Robert Hunter Biden's Motion for Entry of Default Judgment

# **EXHIBIT C**

(Statement of Undisputed Facts  
in Support of His Motion for  
Default Judgment)

1 Richard A. Harpootlian, *pro hac vice*  
*rah@harpootlianlaw.com*

2 Phillip Barber, *pro hac vice*  
*pdb@harpootlianlaw.com*

3 RICHARD A. HARPOOTLIAN, PA  
1410 Laurel Street

4 Columbia, South Carolina 29201

Telephone: (803) 252-4848

5 Facsimile: (803) 252-4810

6 Bryan M. Sullivan, State Bar Number 209743

*bsullivan@earlysullivan.com*

7 Zachary C. Hansen, State Bar Number 325128

*zhansen@earlysullivan.com*

8 EARLY SULLIVAN WRIGHT

GIZER & McRAE LLP

9 6420 Wilshire Boulevard, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor

Los Angeles, California 90048

10 Telephone: (323) 301-4660

Facsimile: (323) 301-4676

11 Attorneys for PLAINTIFF

12 ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN

13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

14 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

15 **WESTERN DIVISION**

16 ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN, an  
individual,

17 Plaintiff,

18 vs.

19 PATRICK M. BYRNE, an individual,

20 Defendant.

Case No. 2:23-cv-09430-SVW-PD

**PLAINTIFF ROBERT HUNTER  
BIDEN'S SEPARATE STATEMENT  
OF UNDISPUTED FACTS IN  
SUPPORT OF HIS MOTION FOR  
DEFAULT JUDGMENT**

Judge: Hon. Stephen V. Wilson

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26 Plaintiff Robert Hunter Biden ("Plaintiff") hereby submits this Statement of  
27 Undisputed Facts In Support Of His Motion For Default Judgment, as follows:  
28

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
<p>1. This lawsuit arises from the false and defamatory statements that Defendant made about Plaintiff in an “interview” that appeared in the “inaugural” issue of “Capitol Times Magazine,” which appears originally to have been published on or about June 27, 2023 (the “Article”).</p>	<p>Dkt No. 85-1 [10/17/2024 Declaration of Michael Murphy (“10/17/2024 Murphy Decl.”), ¶2, Ex. A]; Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/2025 Declaration of Zachary C. Hansen (“11/04/25 Hansen Decl.”), at ¶2, Ex. 1 at Responses to Requests for Admissions (“RFA’s”) Nos. 1, 2, 8, and 14].</p>
<p>2. On page 72 of the Article, Defendant makes the following statements about Plaintiff (i.e., the Defamatory Statements):</p> <p>“So in November 2021, I went back to the Middle East. I met with a group including a special Iranian figure, an old friend who let me know a World War was coming, and had a proposal to avert it. I told them I would relay the proposal but I did not think it would fly.</p> <p>In the course of being there, and through a mechanism I am not going to explain here, I became aware of an additional situation. Hunter Biden was reaching out to the Iranian government in the fall of 2021 with the following offer: <i>You Iranians have \$8 billion frozen in a bank account in South Korea. My father will unfreeze it in return for \$800 million being funneled into a numbered account for us. And if you do this deal with us, it will lubricate other negotiations which have recently started between us.</i> By that, the Iranians believed that Hunter meant the JCPOA talks, which had</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶3, Ex. 2 at pg. 73].</p>

5825609.1

2

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	restarted in Geneva a month or two	
3	previously. In other words, something	
4	along the lines of, “Pay us \$100 million	
5	and we let you keep 10 nukes, \$200	
6	million for 20 nukes,” etc. But I am	
7	making up the pricing. Hunter was doing	
8	this through a middleman, the son of the	
9	Minister of Defense of Pakistan. That	
10	son was meeting with Hunter, then	
11	relaying messages to someone in Iran.	
12	And he was being reckless enough to	
13	leave voicemails in Iran about it.	
14	When I returned, the agencies went to	
15	work over the weekend. I was told a	
16	week later that they had confirmed it all.	
17	The voice on the voicemail that I had	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶3, Ex. 2 at pg. 74].
18	acquired was voice-matched to the son	
19	of the Minister of Defense of Pakistan,	
20	who had a connection to Hunter Biden.	
21	Anyway, in December, 2021, I was told	
22	that the scheme was confirmed across	
23	the agencies.”	
24	3. In response to the Defamatory	
25	Statements, the unidentified	
26	“interviewer” for “Capitol Times	
27	Magazine” asked Defendant to confirm	
28	what he was saying: “Patrick, you are	
	claiming that 18 months ago, the Biden	
	Family was seeking a bribe from Iran to	
	release funds frozen in South Korea, and	
	to go easy in nuclear talks, and that the	
	United States Government has been	
	aware of this since December, 2021?”	
	Byrne responded: “100% correct.”	

5825609.1

3

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	4. On March 20, 2022, Defendant posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
3	on Telegram boasting and celebrating	¶4, Ex. 3].
4	about a possible criminal indictment of	
5	Biden with demeaning pictures.	
6	5. On April 7, 2022, Defendant reposted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶5,
7	on Telegram a Tweet from another	Ex. 4].
8	person saying “As it stands: Hunter’s	
9	laptop is real, the Biden family sells	
10	access to the President[.]”	
11	6. On October 20, 2022, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶6,
12	posted a video on Telegram with a	Ex. 5].
13	headline that states “HUNT IS ON	
14	Hunter Biden laptop report with	
15	evidence of sex & drug ‘crimes’ sent to	
16	Congress & lawmakers are ready to	
17	investigate” that included a link to the	
18	“Biden Laptop Report” published by	
19	right-wing radicals Marco Polo USA and	
20	Garrett Ziegler.	
21	7. On December 12, 2022, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶7,
22	reposted a post on Telegram with	Ex. 6].
23	accusations against the Biden family, a	
24	demeaning picture of Plaintiff, and a	
25	screenshot of a private text thread	
26	between Plaintiff and his daughter.	
27	8. On February 10, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶8,
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	posted on X a taunt to Plaintiff saying	Ex. 7].
3	“Hunter: here’s the secret. It was I. Rudy	
4	[Guiliani] had only acquired a defective	
5	copy [of the laptop]. Working with a	
6	hacker, I acquired a forensic copy,	
7	caused the 400,000 file you bleached to	
8	be recovered, and gave it all to Garrett	
9	Ziegler.”	
10	9. On February 12, 2023, Byrne posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶9,
11	on X a video of an interview he	Ex. 8].
12	previously gave about Plaintiff in which	
13	he made disparaging remarks and in the	
14	post stated “Oldie but Goodie. Patrick	
15	Byrne Weights In On Jack Maxey’s	
16	Hunter Biden Laptop Story”	
17	10. On February 24, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
18	posted on X taunting Plaintiff about	¶10, Ex. 9].
19	Defendant’s possession of files that he	
20	claims Plaintiff tried to delete and	
21	bragging that Defendant handed them	
22	over to the ring-wing radical	
23	organization Marco Polo USA.	
24	11. On March 17, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
25	posted on X taunting Plaintiff and	¶11, Ex. 10].
26	alluding to his Defamatory Statements	
27	that underline this lawsuit by saying	
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	“Hey Hunter, I acquired the forensic	
3	copy [of the laptop] add [sic] got it	
4	distributed to Garrett [Ziegler]. Sue me.	
5	While we are at it, let’s talk about Iran	
6	and the son of the minister of defense of	
7	Pakistan.”	
8	12. On March 17, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
9	posted a comment to his own post on X	¶11, Ex. 10].
10	from the same day accusing Plaintiff of	
11	having and creating child pornography.	
12	13. On March 28, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
13	posted on X taunting Plaintiff by saying	¶12, Ex. 11].
14	“Hunter Biden threatens to sue me.	
15	Hunter: be ready to answers [sic]	
16	questions about the son of the Pakistani	
17	Minister of Defense you used as a go-	
18	between & your offer through him (10%	
19	X \$8 billion + “lubricate other	
20	discussions”). He was careless + I have	
21	recordings.”	
22	14. On May 12, 2023 Defendant posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
23	‘X’ stating: “I have drop [sic] some	¶13, Ex. 12].
24	major truth bombs about Iran and Hunter	
25	Biden in the last two days on Emerald	
26	Robinson. Start here at minute, 28:45.”	
27	15. On June 24, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	reposted an article calling for Plaintiff to	¶14, Ex. 13].
3	be sent to prison.	
4	16. On May 10, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
5	appeared on <i>The Absolute Truth with</i>	¶15, Ex. 14].
6	<i>Emerald Robinson</i> and promoted the	
7	Article, and also aired his Defamatory	
8	Statements about Plaintiff.	
9	17. On May 11, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
10	appeared on <i>The Absolute Truth with</i>	¶¶16-17, Ex. 15-16].
11	<i>Emerald Robinson</i> and promoted the	
12	Article, and also aired his Defamatory	
13	Statements about Plaintiff.	
14	18. Following Defendant's appearance	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
15	on <i>The Absolute Truth with Emerald</i>	¶¶13, 18, Ex. 12, 17].
16	<i>Robinson</i> on May 10 and 11, 2023,	
17	Defendant promoted his appearances on	
18	social media.	
19	19. After publishing the Defamatory	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
20	Statements in the Article, Defendant	¶¶19-27, Ex. 18-26].
21	then repeatedly reposted the Article on	
22	various social media platforms	
23	encouraging his followers to share it to	
24	as many people as possible and	
25	promoted the Article during right-wing	
26	media appearances, encouraging people	
27	to read and purchase copies of the	
28		



1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	magazine for themselves.	
3	20. Byrne made a July 21, 2023	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
4	appearance on <i>The Alex Jones Show</i> ,	¶¶28-29, Ex. 27-28].
5	with infamous host Alex Jones.	
6	21. In Defendant's appearance on <i>The</i>	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
7	<i>Alex Jones Show</i> , on July 21, 2023,	¶¶28-29, Ex. 27-28 at pg. 26-28, 35, 49].
8	Defendant promoted the Article	
9	containing the Defamatory Statements	
10	about Plaintiff.	
11	22. In Defendant's appearance on <i>The</i>	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
12	<i>Alex Jones Show</i> , on July 21, 2023,	¶¶28-29, Ex. 27-28 at pg. 44, 46].
13	Defendant described his ongoing fight to	
14	"de-Nazi-fy" our federal "institutions"	
15	and to rescue America from an ongoing	
16	plot by "globalists" to "colonize" the	
17	United States and turn it into a "vassal	
18	state" that will serve as "a farm to	
19	China."	
20	23. On July 21, 2023, Defendant posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
21	on X several photographs of a large	¶30, Ex. 29].
22	utility truck driving around Washington,	
23	D.C., with TV screens on all sides	
24	displaying and promoting the Article and	
25	Defendant's Defamatory Statements	
26	about Plaintiff.	
27	24. On September 8, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
28		

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
<p>1 appeared on <i>The Courtenay Turner</i></p> <p>2 <i>Podcast</i> to promote the Article and his</p> <p>3 Defamatory Statements about Plaintiff,</p> <p>4 in which he noted that there was talk of</p> <p>5 a book and a movie coming out based on</p> <p>6 the Article.</p>	<p>¶¶31-32, Ex. 30-31, at pg. 1-4, 57].</p>
<p>8 25. After Defendant's September 8,</p> <p>9 2023 appearance on <i>The Courtenay</i></p> <p>10 <i>Turner Podcast</i>, Defendant posted a link</p> <p>11 to the interview on his Telegram page to</p> <p>12 promote it as well.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶33, Ex. 32].</p>
<p>13 26. On October 8, 2023, shortly after</p> <p>14 news broke of the horrific terrorist</p> <p>15 attacks by Hamas against Israel on</p> <p>16 October 7<sup>th</sup>, Defendant reposted the</p> <p>17 Defamatory Statements on his social</p> <p>18 media account on X suggesting that</p> <p>19 Plaintiff and his alleged criminal</p> <p>20 dealings with Iran had contributed to the</p> <p>21 terrorist attacks by Hamas against Israel,</p> <p>22 which caused more than 1,400 civilian</p> <p>23 deaths and led to what is currently a</p> <p>24 massive armed conflict in the Middle</p> <p>25 East.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶¶2, 34-35, Ex. 1 at RFA's Nos. 26-30, 33-34].</p>
<p>26 27. On October 17, 2023, Defendant</p> <p>27 twice responded to U.S. Rep. Eric</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶¶36-37, Ex. 35-36].</p>

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	Swalwell's posts on social media	
3	platform X about in response to	
4	Defendant's October 8, 2023 posts with	
5	the Defamatory Statements and included	
6	a link to the Article on his	
7	deepcapture.com website.	
8	28. Defendant's X posts on October 8,	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
9	2023 and October 17, 2023 as set forth	¶¶34-37, Ex. 33-36].
10	in Plaintiff's Controversies Facts Nos. 26-	
11	27, have been viewed by more than	
12	100,000 people.	
13	29. The day after Plaintiff filed this	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
14	lawsuit, on November 9, 2023,	¶38, Ex. 37].
15	Defendant posted on X taunting Plaintiff	
16	over the lawsuit stating "Hunter's	
17	lawsuit against me (my interpretation):	
18	"Now that I've got Daddy's DOJ under	
19	control... Let's silence Byrne with a	
20	lawsuit + gag order." Good luck with	
21	that. PS Hunter, my 1 <sup>st</sup> witness is a 35	
22	year federal agent who will attest I told	
23	the truth and FBI verified it" and over	
24	72,000 people viewed that post.	
25	30. On November 13, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
26	appeared on Roger Stone's podcast, <i>The</i>	¶¶39-40, Ex. 38-39, at pg. 1-5].
27	<i>StoneZONE with Roger Stone</i> , and	
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	Defendant once again promoted the	
3	Article, taunted Plaintiff about the	
4	lawsuit, and reiterated all of the same	
5	Defamatory Statements he asserted in	
6	the Article.	
7	31. In his November 13, 2023,	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
8	Defendant appearance on <i>The</i>	¶¶39-40, Ex. 38-39, at pg. 2, 4].
9	<i>StoneZONE with Roger Stone</i> ,	
10	Defendant made taunting statements	
11	such as “I won’t lose two minutes of	
12	sleep on his lawsuit against me. ... I have	
13	him dead to rights. ... I’ll meet Hunter in	
14	any court in the land. ... So good luck to	
15	you, Hunter.”	
16	32. On November 9, 2023, the same day	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
17	he appeared on <i>The StoneZONE with</i>	¶41, Ex. 40].
18	<i>Roger Stone</i> , Defendant posted a link to	
19	the interview on X and promoted the	
20	interview across his social media	
21	platforms.	
22	33. In February 2024, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
23	published a book called <i>Danger Close:</i>	¶42, Ex. 41].
24	<i>Domestic Extremist #1 Comes Clean</i>	
25	(the “Book”), which contains the same	
26	Defamatory Statements about Plaintiff	
27	that were published in the Article.	
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	34. Since the publication of Defendant’s	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
3	Book in February 2024, Defendant has	¶¶43-48, Ex. 42-47].
4	repeatedly promoted and advertised his	
5	Book across social media and in various	
6	interviews with ring-wing media	
7	members.	
8	35. Defendant has continued his taunting	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
9	of Plaintiff since the commencement of	¶49, Ex. 48].
10	this litigation, which included a post on	
11	X on July 22, 2024 before Plaintiff’s	
12	deposition and directed at Plaintiff in	
13	which Defendant stated “Hi Hunter. I	
14	understand [sic] am going to be deposing	
15	you in about three weeks? Hoorah! Wait	
16	until you see what I have on you. Let us	
17	see how much more prison time I can get	
18	you.”	
19	36. Defendant has continued his taunting	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
20	of Plaintiff since the commencement of	¶50, Ex. 49].
21	this litigation, which included a post on	
22	Telegram on June 5, 2024 in which	
23	Defendant taunted Plaintiff and posted	
24	derogatory statements directed at	
25	Plaintiff, stating “Hey Hunter, don’t	
26	forget: I was the guy who got the	
27	unredacted version of your hard drive	
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	into the hands of Marco Polo” and	
3	finished the post with calling Plaintiff	
4	“beeyatch.”	
5	37. Defendant has continued his taunting	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
6	of Plaintiff since the commencement of	¶51, Ex. 50].
7	this litigation, which included a post on	
8	Telegram on October 7, 2024 in which	
9	Defendant included derogatory	
10	statements about Plaintiff and stated	
11	“stated that he was “starting to doubt	
12	Biden loyalty to USA”, that “I think (and	
13	hope) Biden knows he got ass-rape-	
14	humiliated by Obama this year”, and	
15	then compared him to Darth Vader from	
16	the Star Wars franchise.	
17	38. Plaintiff denies all of the allegations	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
18	by Defendant in the Defamatory	¶58, Ex. 57 at 30:17-18 and 53:16-54:9].
19	Statements.	
20	39. In response to Plaintiff’s written	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.
21	discovery requests asking for Defendant	¶¶2, 52-53, Ex. 1 at RFA’s Nos. 3-4, 6,
22	to identify each and every source upon	9-10, 12, 15-16, 18, 21-22, 24, 33-34,
23	which he relied in making the	39-40, 44-45; Ex. 51 at Interrogatories
24	Defamatory Statements, Defendant	(“ROG’s”) Nos. 9, 14-16, 18; and Ex. 52
25	admitted that, in making the Defamatory	at Requests for the Production of
26	Statements, he only relied on the	Documents (“RFP’s) Nos. 6, 9-13, 15-
27	information set forth in the Affidavit of	19, 22-23].
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	John Moynihan, information provided to	
3	him by David Smith, and the telephone	
4	voicemail recordings (the	
5	“Voicemails”).	
6	40. The Affidavit of Mr. Moynihan does	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
7	not contain any supporting information	¶¶52-54, Ex. 51 at ROG’s No. 9, 15, 18;
8	about the Defamatory Statements other	Ex. 52 at RFP Nos. 6, 9-13, 15-19, 22-
9	than just reiterating Defendant’s	23; Ex. 53].
10	Defamatory Statements, and Mr.	
11	Moynihan actually admits his	
12	knowledge of the same is based off a	
13	recording on a cell phone that Defendant	
14	showed him and not from independent	
15	sources.	
16	41. The unauthenticated Voicemails do	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
17	not identify who the caller is nor do they	¶¶52-53, 55-57, Ex. 51 at ROG’s No. 18;
18	contain any information about Plaintiff	Ex. 52 at RFP Nos. 6, 9-13, 15-19, 22-
19	or the Defamatory Statements and do not	23; Ex. 54-56].
20	even mention the name Hunter Biden or	
21	any bribe or any information in the	
22	statements made by Defendant.	
23	42. David Smith was identified by	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
24	Defendant in discovery responses as	¶52, Ex. 51 at ROG’s Nos. 9, 15, 18].
25	being an FBI agent and listed the	
26	Washington DC field office as contact,	
27	but no evidence has been presented as to	
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	what Mr. Smith told Plaintiff about	
3	Plaintiff or the Defamatory Statements.	
4	43. Defendant claims to have played	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
5	important roles in various clandestine	¶¶3, 28-29, 31-32, 39-40, Ex. 2, 27-28,
6	“operations” conducted on behalf of the	30-31, 38-39].
7	“United States Government.”	
8	44. According to Defendant, he has	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
9	carried out numerous secret spy	¶¶3, 28-29, 31-37, 39-40, Ex. 2 at pg. 28-
10	“missions” for “Uncle Sam” (with cloak-	32, 34-41, 47-59, 77-78, 82-88, ; Ex. 27;
11	and-dagger nicknames such as	Ex. 28 at pg. 49; Ex. 30; Ex. 31 at pg. 16,
12	“Operation Snow Globe”) to advance	18-20, 25; Ex. 38; Ex. 39 at pg. 8-18].
13	United States interests around the world,	
14	including helping to restore “peaceful	
15	relations” in Vietnam in 1994, helping to	
16	prevent a war with Iran in 2006,	
17	assessing the “computer science	
18	capabilities” of Venezuela in 2018, and,	
19	of course, entering into an intimate	
20	relationship with 26 year-old Maria	
21	Butina, apparently as a means to help the	
22	FBI gather “intel” on Russia. (Defendant	
23	claims he let his FBI handlers know: “I	
24	am not seeing Maria unless you folks use	
25	the word ‘greenlight’ with me. I got back	
26	a simple message: ‘Greenlight.’”)	
27	45. Defendant claims that, at times, the	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
28		



1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	requests for him to deploy his “unique”	¶¶3, 28-29, 31-32, 39-40, Ex. 2 at pg. 37-40, 50-51, 53; Ex. 27; Ex. 28 at pg. 49; Ex. 30; Ex. 31 at pg. 16-20, 28-29; Ex. 38; Ex. 39 at pg. 8-14].
3	skills to help the United States have	
4	come directly from the highest levels of	
5	the U.S. government, including, without	
6	limitation, President Barack Obama and	
7	FBI Director James Comey, personally,	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶¶3, 28-29, 31-32, 39-40, Ex. 2 at pg. 37-38, 74; Ex. 30; Ex. 31 at pg. 18-20; Ex. 38; Ex. 39 at pg. 4-7].
8	although they were communicated to	
9	Defendant verbally by unnamed special	
10	agents for the FBI.	
11	46. Defendant frequently admits he has	
12	no documentation to support his self-	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶58, Ex. 57 at 30:17-18].
13	aggrandizing claims—his “patriotic”	
14	activities have been too secret and	
15	dangerous for documentation.	
16	47. At Plaintiff’s deposition, Plaintiff	
17	testified that “Mr. Byrne’s statements are	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶59, Ex. 58].
18	patently fiction, completely made up[.]”	
19	48. Defendant is a leading promoter of	
20	unsupported conspiracy theories relating	
21	to the so-called “Deep State” and to his	
22	claim that the 2020 presidential election	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶59, Ex. 58].
23	was “stolen” from former President	
24	Donald Trump by Plaintiff’s father,	
25	President Joe Biden.	
26	49. Defendant published a book called	
27	“ <i>The Deep Rig: How Election Fraud</i>	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶59, Ex. 58].
28		

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
<p>Cost Donald J. Trump the White House, By a Man Who did not Vote for Him: (or what to send friends who ask, “Why do you doubt the integrity of the Election 2020?”)” in March 2021.</p>	
<p>50. On April 17, 2023, Defendant posted on his X account “The insurrection was November 3” in response to an X post that stated “There was NO “insurrection” on January 6<sup>th</sup> What actually happened was the INTENTIONAL DISRUPTION of the public examination of the MASSIVE VOTER FRAUD that had occurred in November.”</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶60, Ex. 59].</p>
<p>51. On April 8, 2024, Defendant posted on his X account “Humd’allah! The insurrection was November 3” in response to an X post that stated “Jan 6 was not an insurrection. It was the reaction to one.”</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶61, Ex. 60].</p>
<p>52. On January 5, 2023, Defendant posted on his X account “The Insurrection did not occur January 6, 2021. The Insurrection occurred on November 3, 2020. There I said it. Give</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶62, Ex. 61].</p>

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	me a retweet if you agree” with a poll	
3	asking whether “The Insurrection	
4	occurred on: January 6, 2021 [or]	
5	November 3, 2020.”	
6	53. On June 25, 2023, Defendant posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
7	on his X account “All of us should know	¶63, Ex. 62].
8	this story. It is the single clearest story of	
9	the Fedsurrection” in response to a post	
10	on X about the January 6, 2021 events in	
11	Washington, D.C.	
12	54. On May 10, 2023, Defendant posted	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
13	on his X account “Newsflash, Tapper:	¶64, Ex. 63].
14	The Insurrection was Nov 3 (J6 was the	
15	Fedsurrection); Pence COULD have	
16	remanded issue to states; Officer	
17	Michael White is a pussy-thug; Kaitlin	
18	Collins was indeed nasty. What else you	
19	got.”	
20	55. On January 7, 2023, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
21	posted on his X account “FINAL	¶65, Ex. 64].
22	RESULTS: 96.8% believe “The	
23	Insurrection” occurred November 3,	
24	2020. I guess that makes January 6...	
25	“the Fedsurrection”?”	
26	56. On October 26, 2024, Defendant	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
27	posted on his X account “Biden says the	¶66, Ex. 65].
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	election is dead and buried. Anybody involved in cheating better get this joke: you're not going to win, and this time you'll have committed treason. Stop flogging a dead horse. You're making it worse for yourselves."	
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	57. Defendant recently announced that	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶67, Ex. 66].
9	his Book with the Defamatory	
10	Statements is being turned into a mini-	
11	series called " <i>The Enemy Within</i> " that	
12	viewers must pay to watch, and which is	
13	advertised on Defendant's X account.	
14	58. Defendant recently announced that	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶68, Ex. 67].
15	his Book with the Defamatory	
16	Statements is being turned into a mini-	
17	series called " <i>The Enemy Within</i> " that	
18	viewers must pay to watch, and there is	
19	a dedicated website for the mini-series.	
20	59. On September 2, 2024, Defendant's	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶69, Ex. 68].
21	counsel and Plaintiff's counsel spoke	
22	about scheduling Defendant's deposition	
23	for the month of September 2024 in	
24	person in Florida, which is Defendant's	
25	state of residence.	
26	60. On September 2, 2024, when	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶69, Ex. 68].
27	Defendant's counsel and Plaintiff's	
28		

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
<p>counsel spoke about scheduling Defendant's deposition in Florida, Defendant's counsel offered to find a location in Florida for Defendant's deposition to take place.</p>	
<p>61. On September 11, 2024, Defendant's counsel stated any in-person deposition of Defendant would have to be in Dubai or via zoom from Dubai, which Plaintiff had an issue with because of the time it takes to travel to Dubai and, upon legal research, the legality of a deposition in Dubai and lack of legal authority authorizing a deposition to occur in Dubai for use in a District Court case in the United States.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶69, Ex. 68].</p>
<p>62. Since September 11, 2024, the scheduling of Defendant's deposition and the location thereof has been the subject of two different Informal Discovery Conferences on September 18, 2024, and October 4, 2024.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶69; Court's Docket Nos. 67 &amp; 79].</p>
<p>63. Since September 11, 2024, the scheduling of Defendant's deposition and the location thereof was also the subject of a discovery motion that was</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl., ¶69; Court's Docket No. 87].</p>

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	filed on October 9, 2024, and which the	
3	Court ruled on October 30, 2024, that	
4	Defendant would be required to return to	
5	the United States for his deposition	
6	before trial and was required to inform	
7	Plaintiff's counsel by November 4,	
8	2024, what federal district he will choose	
9	to appear for his deposition in.	
10	64. In discovery motions in this	Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl.,
11	litigation, Defendant gave wild and	¶70]; Court's Docket Nos. 67 & 76.
12	differing claims about why he was now	
13	residing in Dubai. First, Defendant's	
14	counsel said he was informed by an	
15	unidentified DEA agent that the	
16	Venezuelan government placed a \$25	
17	million bounty on him, and he did not	
18	want to return to the United States due to	
19	safety issues. Then Defendant claimed	
20	in a declaration that he was in Ghana	
21	cooperating with an official with the	
22	Ghanian Ministry of Security who	
23	informed Defendant that criminals in	
24	West Africa were cooperating to get him	
25	in a position where he could be	
26	kidnapped.	
27	65. Defendant admitted to having	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Supplemental
28		

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
negative feelings about Plaintiff.	Declaration of Zachary C. Hansen (“2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.”), at ¶3, Exh. “71” [Byrne Deposition at 385:11-386:2 and 400:1-6].
66. Defendant admitted he was behind the public release of the data on Plaintiff’s laptop that made headlines several years ago.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 377:9-378:19; 388:20-389:7; 390:7-392:15)].
67. Byrne admitted he repeatedly reposted the Article on various social media platforms encouraging his followers to share it to as many people as possible and promoted the Article during right-wing media appearances, encouraging people to read and purchase copies of the magazine for themselves.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 351:9-352:24, 355:11-12, 357:1-17, 369:15-371:4, 372:4-373:14, and 358:28-359:6)].
68. On October 8, 2023, shortly after news broke of the horrific terrorist attacks by Hamas against Israel on October 7 <sup>th</sup> , Byrne literally “double-downed” by twice reposting the Defamatory Statements on his social media account on X suggesting that Plaintiff and his alleged criminal dealings with Iran had contributed to the terrorist attacks by Hamas against Israel,	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 403:15-404:3)].

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
which caused more than 1,400 civilian deaths and led to what is currently a massive armed conflict in the Middle East.	
69. Byrne claims that he twice met with an Iranian government official (at least once in 2021) who he only identified by the covert codename “Movie Star,” and who he identified as “Doe 1” in written discovery responses.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 247:13-19; 255:1-4; 259:2-13; 350:2-19)].
70. In these meetings, Byrne stated that “Movie Star” said that, through “Doe 2”, Plaintiff sought a bribe from Iran to release \$8 billion frozen in South Korea, and to go easy in nuclear talks in 2021 to benefit himself and his family.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 247:13-19; 255:1-4; 259:2-13; 263:19-266:13; 269:15-270:2)].
71. According to Byrne, “Movie Star” identified “Doe 2” as someone who is close to Plaintiff and who is the son of a high ranking Pakistani official in the ministry of defense.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 263:19-266:13; 268:1-14; 269:15-270:2; 272:9-275:17; 350:2-19)].
72. Byrne does not know the identity of “Doe 2” or “Doe 2’s” father.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 261:21-25; 263:19-266:13; 269:15-270:2)].
73. Byrne claims to have surreptitiously	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,



UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
<p>recorded a conversation with “Movie Star” (the “Recording”) in which “Movie Star” made these claims while playing the Voicemails.</p>	<p>at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 259:2-13; 261:8-25; 312:18-315:7; 316:24-317:18; 320:18-321:1; 337:4-14; 337:16-338:9)].</p>
<p>74. Byrne claimed to have surreptitiously obtained the Voicemails from “Movie Star’s” smartphone.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 261:8-25; 312:18-315:7; 316:24-317:18; 337:16-338:9)].</p>
<p>75. Byrne claims to have played the Recording and the Voicemails to John Moynihan.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5).</p>
<p>76. Byrne claims that John Moynihan is Byrne’s contact to an interagency intelligence group within the U.S. government that Byrne calls the “League of Shadows.”</p>	<p>Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5; 230:24-232:10; 308:12-309:5)].</p>
<p>77. Byrne claims that FBI Special Agent David Smith, is a member of the “League of Shadows.”</p>	<p>Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5; 230:24-232:10; 308:12-309:5)].</p>
<p>78. Byrne retained copies of the Voicemails.</p>	<p>Dkt No. 89-1 [11/04/25 Hansen Decl. ¶¶2, 52-53, Ex. 1 at RFA’s Nos. 3-4, 6, 9-10, 12, 15-16, 18, 21-22, 24, 33-34, 39-40, 44-45; Ex. 51 at Interrogatories (“ROG’s”) Nos. 9, 14-16, 18; and Ex. 52 at Requests for the Production of</p>

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
	Documents (“RFP’s) Nos. 6, 9-13, 15-19, 22-23].
79. Byrne testified that he gave the only copy of the Recording to FBI Special Agent David Smith and does not have a copy of it.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5; 268:1-14; 272:9-275:17; 305:4-25)].
80. Byrne claims that he was told by FBI Special Agent David Smith that several agencies worked on identifying “Doe 2” using voice recognition technology.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5; 268:1-14; 270:20-271:19; 272:9-275:17; 275:18-277:13)].
81. Byrne claims that FBI Special Agent David Smith informed him that the agencies verified “Doe 2” was someone who was close to Plaintiff.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 224:14-227:5; 230:24-232:10; 268:1-14; 270:20-271:19; 272:9-275:17; 275:18-277:13)].
82. FBI Special Agent David Smith did not tell Byrne the identity of “Doe 2.”	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 261:21-25)].
83. Nothing in the Recording, Voicemails, or Byrne’s purported conversation with “Movie Star” actually shows any direct involvement of Plaintiff with “Doe 2.”	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 325:16-329:22)].
84. Byrne claims that he was told that “Doe 2” was the son of some unidentified high ranking Pakistani	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl., at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at 261:21-25; 263:19-266:13)].

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	defense ministry official.	
3	85. “Doe 2” is not identified.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
4		at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
5		261:21-25; 263:19-266:13).
6	86. “Doe 2’s” father is not identified.	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
7		at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
8		261:21-25; 263:19-266:13)].
9	87. “Movie Star” never said he spoke	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
10	with Plaintiff.	at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
11		247:13-19; 255:1-4; 259:2-13; 263:19-
12		266:13; 269:15-270:2).
13	88. Byrne claims to have told	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
14	Congressman James Comer about the	at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
15	Defamatory Statements for whom Byrne	206:4-18; 408:16-409:22)].
16	played the Voicemails.	
17	89. Congressman Comer spent two years	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
18	investigating Plaintiff for, among other	at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
19	things, influence peddling and never	206:4-18; 408:16-409:22)].
20	mentioned any connection between	
21	Plaintiff and Iran let alone an attempt to	
22	obtain a bribe.	
23	90. At the November 25, 2024 hearing,	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
24	the Court found that Byrne’s reasons for	at ¶4, Exh. “72” (November 25, 2024
25	delaying his depositions were “fantastic	Hearing 7:24-8:23).
26	without believability.”	
27	91. Byrne testified that he found that	Dkt No. 185-2 [2/3/2025 Hansen Decl.,
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	multiple parts of the Moynihan Affidavit	at ¶3, Exh. “71” (Byrne Deposition at
3	mischaracterized the facts or were not	298:13-300:8; 303:21)].
4	accurate.	
5	92. At the February 24, 2025 hearing,	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Additional
6	this Court recognized that key evidence	Declaration of Zachary C. Hansen
7	in determining whether Defendant	(“5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.”), Exh. “A”
8	Patrick Byrne (“Byrne”) acted with	[2/24/25 Transcript, 4:25-6:1, 18:22-
9	actual malice in publishing the	19:10].
10	statements that Plaintiff Robert Hunter	
11	Biden (“Biden”) solicited a bribe from	
12	Iran to have his father, then President Joe	
13	Biden, release billions of dollars in	
14	sanctioned funds (the “Defamatory	
15	Statements”) was the testimony of FBI	
16	Special Agent David Smith (“Smith”)	
17	and John Moynihan (“Moynihan”).	
18	93. As the Court further recognized, the	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
19	foregoing was because Byrne claimed	Exh. “A” (2/24/25 Transcript, 4:25-6:1,
20	Smith and Moynihan provided him with	18:22-19:10)].
21	material information that supported the	
22	Defamatory Statements or that they	
23	heard material information that	
24	confirmed the Defamatory Statements,	
25	which would have supported the	
26	inference that Byrne had a basis to make	
27	the Defamatory Statements and did not	
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	act with actual malice in making them.	
3	94. Byrne testified that Smith instructed	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
4	Byrne to delete the Recording from his	Exh. "B" (Byrne Depo. Trans. Vol 3 at
5	device after sending it to Smith and	511:8-515:8)].
6	watched him do so.	
7	95. Byrne testified that Smith described	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
8	to Byrne a letter that FBI Director	Exh. "B" (Byrne Depo. Trans. Vol. 3 at
9	Christopher Wray sent out to every FBI	525:2-24, 554:4-24)].
10	agent in the bureau saying not to have	
11	any contact with Byrne.	
12	96. Smith testified that Byrne's	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
13	testimony about the late 2021/early 2022	Exh. "C" (Smith Depo, 5:21-6:22)].
14	meeting at a parking lot at Reagan	
15	National Airport was not accurate.	
16	97. Smith did not recall receiving any	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
17	recording from Byrne related to or	Exh. "C" (Smith Depo, 6:23-7:20, 7:21-
18	involving Hunter Biden and Iranian	8:6, and 11:2-7)].
19	Officials, and Byrne's testimony that	
20	Smith told Byrne to delete the Recording	
21	and not keep a copy of it was not	
22	accurate.	
23	98. Smith testified that Byrne's	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
24	testimony that Smith confirmed, through	Exh. "C" (Smith Depo, 8:7-20)].
25	various actions by various government	
26	agencies, that the identity of the voice on	
27	the Voicemails played on the Recording	
28		

1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	was (1) the son of a high-ranking official	
3	with the Pakistani Minister of Defense,	
4	(2) someone who had close ties to Biden,	
5	and (3) someone who was acting as a	
6	proxy for Biden, was not accurate.	
7	99. Smith testified that Byrne's	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
8	testimony that Smith communicated to	Exh. "C" (Smith Depo, 8:7-20)].
9	Byrne either directly or through	
10	Moynihan the identity of the voice on the	
11	Voicemails was not accurate.	
12	100. Smith testified that Byrne's	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
13	testimony that Smith described to Byrne	Exh. "C" (Smith Depo, 10:13-25)].
14	a letter that FBI Director Christopher	
15	Wray sent out to every FBI agent in the	
16	bureau saying not to have any contact	
17	with Mr. Byrne was not accurate.	
18	101. Moynihan testified that the	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
19	Recording did not say Biden was already	Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans., at
20	involved in the bribery scheme or even	116:23-117:17)].
21	knew about the scheme, but that they	
22	would need to eventually seek Biden's	
23	assistance.	
24	102. Moynihan testified that he does not	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
25	remember that the recording mentioned	Exh.: "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans., at
26	the words "bribe," "father," "10%," "\$8	118:9-119:1)].
27	billion"—all facts stated by Byrne in his	
28		

1	<b>UNDISPUTED FACTS</b>	<b>SUPPORTING EVIDENCE</b>
2	article.	
3	103. Moynihan did not see Byrne give	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
4	the recording to Smith in the car meeting	Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans. at
5	at Ronald Reagan National Airport.	119:10-16, 121:3-8)].
6	104. Moynihan does not know what	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
7	Smith did with the recording or whether	Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans. at
8	he had the recording authenticated in any	123:3-16)].
9	way.	
10	105. Moynihan was never told by Smith	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
11	that the voice of the purported	Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans. at
12	middleman on the recording was	133:4-21)].
13	identified as someone close to Biden, nor	
14	did he communicate any such statements	
15	to Byrne.	
16	106. Byrne's claim that the Affidavit of	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
17	John Moynihan supports the Defamatory	Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo. Trans. at
18	Statements is contradicted by Moynihan	110:10-111:17)].
19	himself, who admitted that his	
20	knowledge of the Defamatory	
21	Statements is based on the Recording	
22	and not from independent sources.	
23	107. Byrne testified that in August of	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl.,
24	2021, Moynihan told Byrne the FBI had	Exh. "E" (Byrne Depo. Trans. at 310:1-
25	a two- to three-day course about the	11)].
26	intelligence career of Patrick Byrne and	
27	Moynihan had gone through it.	
28		



1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	108. Moynihan testified that he did not	Dkt No. 225-2 [5/20/2025 Hansen Decl., Exh. "D" (Moynihan Depo, 69:13-21)].
3	have any knowledge of two- to three-day	
4	course that the FBI organized about the	
5	intelligence career of Mr. Byrne, nor had	
6	he gone through any such course.	
7	109. Based on Byrne's lack of	Dkt No. 268, p. 13-14.
8	credibility, on July 18, 2025, this Court	
9	denied Byrne's summary judgment	
10	motion ("MSJ Denial Order") stating	
11	that "[a] reasonably jury could believe	
12	that [Byrne's] story is made up" and that	
13	Byrne's "story is far-fetched."	
14	110. In the MSJ Denial Order, the Court	Dkt No. 268, at p. 12.
15	stated:	
16	Finally, the substance of Firouzian's	
17	claims themselves is an obvious reason	
18	to doubt their veracity. While technically	
19	possible, they are undoubtedly far-	
20	fetched and fantastical. The son of the	
21	sitting President accepting a nearly one-	
22	billion-dollar bribe from one of the	
23	United States' foreign adversaries would	
24	be one of the most blatant instances of	
25	political corruption in United States	
26	history. In other words, Firouzian's	
27	claims "are so inherently improbable	
28	that only a reckless man would have put	
	them in circulation." <i>See St. Amant</i> , 390	
	U.S. at 732.	
	Finally, the substance of Firouzian's	
	claims themselves is an obvious reason	
	to doubt their veracity. While technically	
	possible, they are undoubtedly far-	

5825609.1



1	UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
2	3	
4	5	
6	7	
8	9	
10	11	
12	13	
14	15	
16	17	
18	19	
20	21	
22	23	
24	25	
26	27	
28	29	
30	31	
32	33	
34	35	
36	37	
38	39	
40	41	
42	43	
44	45	
46	47	
48	49	
50	51	
52	53	
54	55	
56	57	
58	59	
60	61	
62	63	
64	65	
66	67	
68	69	
70	71	
72	73	
74	75	
76	77	
78	79	
80	81	
82	83	
84	85	
86	87	
88	89	
90	91	
92	93	
94	95	
96	97	
98	99	
100	101	
102	103	
104	105	
106	107	
108	109	
110	111	
112	113	
114	115	
116	117	
118	119	
120	121	
122	123	
124	125	
126	127	
128	129	
130	131	
132	133	
134	135	
136	137	
138	139	
140	141	
142	143	
144	145	
146	147	
148	149	
150	151	
152	153	
154	155	
156	157	
158	159	
160	161	
162	163	
164	165	
166	167	
168	169	
170	171	
172	173	
174	175	
176	177	
178	179	
180	181	
182	183	
184	185	
186	187	
188	189	
190	191	
192	193	
194	195	
196	197	
198	199	
200	201	
202	203	
204	205	
206	207	
208	209	
210	211	
212	213	
214	215	
216	217	
218	219	
220	221	
222	223	
224	225	
226	227	
228	229	
230	231	
232	233	
234	235	
236	237	
238	239	
240	241	
242	243	
244	245	
246	247	
248	249	
250	251	
252	253	
254	255	
256	257	
258	259	
260	261	
262	263	
264	265	
266	267	
268	269	
270	271	
272	273	
274	275	
276	277	
278	279	
280	281	
282	283	
284	285	
286	287	
288	289	
290	291	
292	293	
294	295	
296	297	
298	299	
300	301	
302	303	
304	305	
306	307	
308	309	
310	311	
312	313	
314	315	
316	317	
318	319	
320	321	
322	323	
324	325	
326	327	
328	329	
330	331	
332	333	
334	335	
336	337	
338	339	
340	341	
342	343	
344	345	
346	347	
348	349	
350	351	
352	353	
354	355	
356	357	
358	359	
360	361	
362	363	
364	365	
366	367	
368	369	
370	371	
372	373	
374	375	
376	377	
378	379	
380	381	
382	383	
384	385	
386	387	
388	389	
390	391	
392	393	
394	395	
396	397	
398	399	
400	401	
402	403	
404	405	
406	407	
408	409	
410	411	
412	413	
414	415	
416	417	
418	419	
420	421	
422	423	
424	425	
426	427	
428	429	
430	431	
432	433	
434	435	
436	437	
438	439	
440	441	
442	443	
444	445	
446	447	
448	449	
450	451	
452	453	
454	455	
456	457	
458	459	
460	461	
462	463	
464	465	
466	467	
468	469	
470	471	
472	473	
474	475	
476	477	
478	479	
480	481	
482	483	
484	485	
486	487	
488	489	
490	491	
492	493	
494	495	
496	497	
498	499	
500	501	
502	503	
504	505	
506	507	
508	509	
510	511	
512	513	
514	515	
516	517	
518	519	
520	521	
522	523	
524	525	
526	527	
528	529	
530	531	
532	533	
534	535	
536	537	
538	539	
540	541	
542	543	
544	545	
546	547	
548	549	
550	551	
552	553	
554	555	
556	557	
558	559	
560	561	
562	563	
564	565	
566	567	
568	569	
570	571	
572	573	
574	575	
576	577	
578	579	
580	581	
582	583	
584	585	
586	587	
588	589	
590	591	
592	593	
594	595	
596	597	
598	599	
600	601	
602	603	
604	605	
606	607	
608	609	
610	611	
612	613	
614	615	
616	617	
618	619	
620	621	
622	623	
624	625	
626	627	
628	629	
630	631	
632	633	
634	635	
636	637	
638	639	
640	641	
642	643	
644	645	
646	647	
648	649	
650	651	
652	653	
654	655	
656	657	
658	659	
660	661	
662	663	
664	665	
666	667	
668	669	
670	671	
672	673	
674	675	
676	677	
678	679	
680	681	
682	683	
684	685	
686	687	
688	689	
690	691	
692	693	
694	695	
696	697	
698	699	
700	701	
702	703	
704	705	
706	707	
708	709	
710	711	
712	713	
714	715	
716	717	
718	719	
720	721	
722	723	
724	725	
726	727	
728	729	
730	731	
732	733	
734	735	
736	737	
738	739	
740	741	
742	743	
744	745	
746	747	
748	749	
750	751	
752	753	
754	755	
756	757	
758	759	
760	761	
762	763	
764	765	
766	767	
768	769	
770	771	
772	773	
774	775	
776	777	
778	779	
780	781	
782	783	
784	785	
786	787	
788	789	
790	791	
792	793	
794	795	
796	797	
798	799	
800	801	
802	803	
804	805	
806	807	
808	809	
810	811	
812	813	
814	815	
816	817	
818	819	
820	821	
822	823	
824	825	
826	827	
828	829	
830	831	
832	833	
834	835	
836	837	
838	839	
840	841	
842	843	
844	845	
846	847	
848	849	
850	851	
852	853	
854	855	
856	857	
858	859	
860	861	
862	863	
864	865	
866	867	
868	869	
870	871	
872	873	
874	875	
876	877	
878	879	
880	881	
882	883	
884	885	
886	887	
888	889	
890	891	
892	893	
894	895	
896	897	
898	899	
900	901	
902	903	
904	905	
906	907	
908	909	
910	911	
912	913	
914	915	
916	917	
918	919	
920	921	
922	923	
924	925	
926	927	
928	929	
930	931	
932	933	
934	935	
936	937	
938	939	
940	941	
942	943	
944	945	
946	947	
948	949	
950	951	
952	953	
954	955	
956	957	
958	959	
960	961	
962	963	
964	965	
966	967	
968	969	
970	971	
972	973	
974	975	
976	977	
978	979	
980	981	
982	983	
984	985	
986	987	
988	989	
990	991	
992	993	
994	995	
996	997	
998	999	
1000	1001	
1002	1003	
1004	1005	
1006	1007	
1008	1009	
1010	1011	
1012	1013	
1014	1015	
1016	1017	
1018	1019	
1020	1021	
1022	1023	
1024	1025	
1026	1027	
1028	1029	
1030	1031	
1032	1033	
1034	1035	
1036	1037	
1038	1039	
1040	1041	
1042	1043	
1044	1045	
1046	1047	
1048	1049	
1050	1051	
1052	1053	
1054	1055	
1056	1057	
1058	1059	
1060	1061	
1062	1063	
1064	1065	
1066	1067	
1068	1069	
1070	1071	
1072	1073	
1074	1075	
1076	1077	
1078	1079	
1080	1081	
1082	1083	
1084	1085	
1086	1087	
1088	1089	
1090	1091	
1092	1093	
1094	1095	
1096	1097	
1098	1099	
1100	1101	
1102	1103	
1104	1105	
1106	1107	
1108	1109	
1110	1111	
1112	1113	
1114	1115	
1116	1117	
1118	1119	
1120	1121	
1122	1123	
1124	1125	
1126	1127	
1128	1129	
1130	1131	
1132	1133	
1134	1135	
1136	1137	
1138	1139	
1140	1141	
1142	1143	
1144	1145	
1146	1147	
1148	1149	
1150	1151	
1152	1153	
1154	1155	
1156	1157	
1158	1159	
1160	1161	
1162	1163	
1164	1165	
1166	1167	
1168	1169	
1170	1171	
1172	1173	
1174	1175	
1176	1177	
1178	1179	
1180	1181	
1182	1183	
1184	1185	
1186	1187	
1188	1189	
1190	1191	
1192	1193	
1194	1195	
1196	1197	
1198	1199	
1200	1201	
1202	1203	
1204	1205	
1206	1207	
1208	1209	
1210	1211	
1212	1213	
1214	1215	
1216	1217	
1218	1219	
1220	1221	
1222	1223	
1		

UNDISPUTED FACTS	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
extraordinary claims.”	
112. In the MSJ Denial Order, the Court concluded that “Defendant has exhibited ill-will toward Plaintiff in the past.” SUD, ¶ 109	Dkt No. 268, at p. 13.
113. In the MSJ Denial Order, the Court noted:  To start, the entire premise of Defendant's story-that he has for decades acted as a covert agent for the United States government-strains credulity, especially since he fails to support this claim with any evidence.	Dkt No. 268, at p. 14.

Dated: October 9, 2024

EARLY SULLIVAN WRIGHT  
GIZER & MCRAE LLP

By: /s/ Zachary C. Hansen

BRYAN M. SULLIVAN (State Bar No. 209743)  
bsullivan@earlysullivan.com  
ZACHARY C. HANSEN (State Bar No. 325128)  
zhansen@earlysullivan.com  
EARLY SULLIVAN WRIGHT GIZER  
& McRAE LLP  
6420 Wilshire Boulevard, 17th Fl.  
Los Angeles, California 90048  
Telephone: (323) 301-4660  
Facsimile: (323) 301-4676

Richard A. Harpootlian, *pro hac vice*  
rah@harpootlianlaw.com  
Phillip Barber, *pro hac vice*  
pdb@harpootlianlaw.com  
RICHARD A. HARPOOTLIAN, PA  
1410 Laurel Street  
Columbia, South Carolina 29201

1

Telephone: (803) 252-4848  
Facsimile: (803) 252-4810

2

3

*Attorney for Plaintiff*  
*Robert Hunter Biden*

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28